



November 13, 2019

VIA EMAIL

Hugh Gilmore
Freedom of Information Officer
Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services
North Building, Room N2-20-06
7500 Security Boulevard
Baltimore, Maryland 21244
FOIA_Request@cms.hhs.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear Mr. Gilmore:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of your agency, 45 C.F.R Part 5, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

On October 4, 2019, President Trump announced that certain immigrants would no longer be allowed to enter the country unless they “possess[] the financial resources to pay for reasonably foreseeable medical costs.” Nearly instantaneously, questions were raised about how this proclamation would be implemented, its legality, and whether and to what extent federal officials with expertise in health coverage were involved in its crafting.¹

American Oversight seeks records with the potential to shed light on whether and to what extent agency officials are engaging with the external entities likely to be involved in executing the president’s recent proclamation.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that the Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services (CMS) produce the following records within twenty business days:

All email communications (including email messages, email attachments, calendar invitations, and calendar invitation attachments) between (a) the federal officials listed in Column A in the chart below, and (b) any officials or representatives of the state agencies or organizations listed in Column B, regarding the October 4,

¹ See Dan Diamond, *Health Officials: Trump Immigration Order Could Be Illegal*, POLITICO (Oct. 11, 2019, 10:29 PM), <https://www.politico.com/news/2019/10/11/trump-immigrants-health-insurance-illegal-044716>.



2019 “Presidential Proclamation on the Suspension of Entry of Immigrants Who Will Financially Burden the United States Healthcare System” and implementation thereof.

Column A: Federal Officials	Column B: State Agencies & Organizations
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Seema Verma, CMS Administrator, and anyone communicating on her behalf, including executive assistants, personal assistants, and schedulers ii. Brady Brooks, CMS Deputy Administrator and Deputy Chief of Staff iii. Kimberly Brandt, CMS Principal Deputy Administrator iv. Randy Pate, CMS Deputy Administrator and Director of the Center for Consumer Information and Insurance Oversight (CCIIO) v. Jeff Grant, CCIIO Deputy Director for Operations vi. Jeff Wu, CCIIO Deputy Director for Policy vii. Matthew Lynch, Director, State Marketplace and Insurance Programs Group 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Arizona Department of Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @azinsurance.gov ii. California Department of Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @insurance.ca.gov iii. California Department of Managed Health Care, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @dmhc.ca.gov iv. California Health Benefit Exchange (Covered California), including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @covered.ca.gov v. Idaho Department of Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @doi.idaho.gov vi. Illinois Department of Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @illinois.gov vii. Iowa Insurance Division, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @iid.iowa.gov viii. Kentucky Department of Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @ky.gov

<p>viii. Jenny Chen, Director, Division of State Technical Assistance</p>	<p>ix. Mississippi Insurance Department, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @mid.ms.gov</p> <p>x. New Jersey Department of Banking & Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @dobi.nj.gov</p> <p>xi. New Mexico Office of Superintendent of Insurance, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @state.nm.us</p> <p>xii. New Mexico Health Insurance Exchange (beWellnm), including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @nmhix.com</p> <p>xiii. New York State Department of Financial Services, including anyone with an email address ending in @dfs.ny.gov</p> <p>xiv. New York State of Health, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @health.ny.gov</p> <p>xv. Pennsylvania Department of Insurance, including anyone with an email address ending in @pa.gov</p> <p>xvi. Tennessee Department of Commerce & Insurance, including anyone with an email address ending in @tn.gov</p> <p>xvii. Utah Insurance Department, including anyone with an email address ending in @utah.gov</p> <p>xviii. Washington State Office of the Insurance Commissioner, including anyone communicating with an email address ending @oic.wa.gov</p>
---	---

	<p>xix. Washington Health Benefit Exchange, including anyone communicating with an email address ending in @wahbexchange.org</p> <p>xx. National Association of Insurance Commissioners, including Jolie Matthews, Brian Webb, Jennifer Cook, Joe Tuschner, and anyone communicating with an email address ending in @naic.org</p>
--	--

Please provide all responsive records from October 1, 2019, through the date the search is conducted.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency’s regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is “in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government.”² The public has a significant interest in knowing if and how the president’s proclamation will be carried out.³ Records with the potential to shed light on this matter would contribute significantly to public understanding of operations of the federal government, including the specific policies and procedures that may apply to immigrants seeking entry to this country. American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public’s understanding of the government’s activities would be enhanced through American Oversight’s analysis and publication of these records.

² 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

³ See Diamond, *supra* note 2; Kristina Cooke & Mica Rosenberg, *Trump Rule on Health Insurance Leaves Immigrants, Companies Scrambling for Answers*, REUTERS (Oct. 31, 2019, 7:10 AM), <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-immigration-insurance/trump-rule-on-health-insurance-leaves-immigrants-companies-scrambling-for-answers-idUSKBN1XA1G6>.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁴ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight's financial interest. American Oversight's mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.⁵

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through numerous substantive analyses posted to its website.⁶ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department's process for issuing such waivers;⁷ posting records received as part of American Oversight's "Audit the Wall" project to gather and analyze information related to the administration's proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;⁸ posting records regarding potential self-dealing at the Department of Housing & Urban Development and related analysis;⁹ posting records and analysis relating to the federal

⁴ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁵ American Oversight currently has approximately 12,300 page likes on Facebook and 55,900 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, FACEBOOK, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Nov. 8, 2019); American Oversight (@weareoversight), TWITTER, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited Nov. 8, 2019).

⁶ News, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

⁷ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco's Recusal*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

⁸ See generally *Audit the Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; see, e.g., *Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

⁹ *Documents Reveal Ben Carson Jr.'s Attempts to Use His Influence at HUD to Help His Business*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/documents-reveal-ben-carson-jr-s-attempts-to-use-his-influence-at-hud-to-help-his-business>.

government's efforts to sell nuclear technology to Saudi Arabia;¹⁰ and posting records and analysis regarding the Department of Justice's decision in response to demands from Congress to direct a U.S. Attorney to undertake a wide-ranging review and make recommendations regarding criminal investigations relating to the President's political opponents and allegations of misconduct by the Department of Justice itself and the Federal Bureau of Investigation.¹¹

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹² It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹³
- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide

¹⁰ *Investigating the Trump Administration's Efforts to Sell Nuclear Technology to Saudi Arabia*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigating-the-trump-administrations-efforts-to-sell-nuclear-technology-to-saudi-arabia>.

¹¹ *Sessions' Letter Shows DOJ Acted on Trump's Authoritarian Demand to Investigate Clinton*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/sessions-letter>.

¹² See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹³ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁴ and many agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency's archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of

¹⁴ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Christine H. Monahan at foia@americanoversight.org or (202) 869-5244. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Austin R. Evers", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the left.

Austin R. Evers
Executive Director
American Oversight