



March 23, 2020

VIA EMAIL

Sam Kaplan
Chief Privacy Officer
The Privacy Office
U.S. Department of Homeland Security
245 Murray Lane SW
STOP-0655
Washington, D.C. 20528-0655
foia@hq.dhs.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear Freedom of Information Officer:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of the Department of Homeland Security (DHS), 6 C.F.R. Part 5, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

After the U.S. Court of Appeals for the 9th Circuit ordered the federal government to suspend the Migrant Protection Protocols, otherwise known as the Remain in Mexico policy, the Supreme Court reversed that decision on March 11, 2020.¹ The Solicitor General wrote in a brief that 25,000 people currently waiting in Mexico while their cases process would “rush immediately to enter the United States.” Despite numerous reports of sexual assault², kidnapping³, children under the program presenting themselves, alone,

¹ Robert Barnes, *Supreme Court Says Trump Administration May Continue ‘Remain in Mexico’ Policy for Asylum Seekers*, THE WASHINGTON POST, Mar. 11, 2020 (4:59 PM),

https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/courts_law/supreme-court-trump-remain-in-mexico/2020/03/11/7abd4b9c-62d7-11ea-acca-80c22bbee96f_story.html

² Adolfo Flores, *An Asylum-Seeker Who Was Kidnapped And Tortured With Acid Begged US Border Officers Not To Send Her Back. They Did Anyway.*, BUZZFEED NEWS, Mar. 7, 2020 (3:04 PM), <https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/adolfoflores/asylum-seeker-tortured-mexico>

³ Camille Squires, *Torture, Rape, and Kidnapping at the Border: A New Report Lays Bare the Horror of Trump’s Asylum Plan*, MOTHERJONES, Jan. 23, 2020, <https://www.motherjones.com/politics/2020/01/migrant-protection-protocols-remain-in-mexico-trump/>



at the border⁴, and rampant violence⁵ upon migrants under MPP, the government's position was that a suspension of this policy would result in a surge and "impose extraordinary burdens" on the government.

American Oversight seeks records with the potential to shed light on whether and to what extent the agencies responsible for maintaining this policy have taken action to ensure the safety of asylum seekers ordered to remain in Mexico.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that your agency produce the following records within twenty business days:

All email communications (including complete email chains, email attachments, calendar invitations, and attachments thereto) sent by any of the USCIS officials or employees listed below containing any of the following terms:

- a. "MPP"
- b. "M.P.P."
- c. "Migrant Protection Protocols"
- d. "Migrant Protection Protocol"
- e. "remain in Mexico"
- f. "remain-in-Mexico"
- g. "RIM"
- h. PACR
- i. "Prompt Asylum Claim Review"
- j. "Asylum Cooperation Agreement"
- k. HARP
- l. "Humanitarian Asylum Review Process"
- m. "soft-sided"
- n. "soft sided"
- o. "safe third"
- p. "safe 3rd"

The search may be limited to the following DHS custodians:

- i. Chad Wolf, Acting Secretary

⁴ Debbie Nathan, *Migrant Children Trapped in Mexico are Leaving Their Families and Crossing the Border Alone*, THE INTERCEPT, Oct. 29, 2019 (9:00 AM), <https://theintercept.com/2019/10/29/mexico-migrant-unaccompanied-children-border-crossing/>

⁵ David Agren, *Remain in Mexico: 80% of Migrants in Trump Policy are Victims of Violence*, THE GUARDIAN, Jan. 29, 2020 (6:51 PM), <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2020/jan/29/migrants-mexico-trump-policy-victims-of-violence>

- ii. Chad Mizelle, Chief of Staff
- iii. Ken Cuccinelli, Acting Deputy Secretary

Please provide all responsive records for all requests from November 13, 2019 through the date the search is conducted.

In an effort to accommodate DHS and reduce the number of responsive records to be processed and produced, American Oversight has limited its request to emails sent by the specified agency officials. To be clear, however, American Oversight still requests that complete email chains be produced, displaying both the sent messages and the prior received messages in each email chain. This means, for example, that both Acting Secretary Wolf's response to an email and the initial received message are responsive to this request and should be produced.

This request includes all prior messages (whether incoming or outgoing) reflected in the responsive correspondence and any attachments thereto.

Please note that American Oversight does not seek, and that this request specifically excludes, the initial mailing of news clips or other mass-distribution emails. However, subsequent communications forwarding such emails are responsive to this request. In other words, for example, if Acting Secretary Wolf received a mass-distribution news clip email referencing the relevant statement by the president, that initial email would not be responsive to this request. However, if Acting Secretary Wolf forwarded that email to another individual with his own commentary, that subsequent message would be responsive to this request and should be produced.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency's regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is "in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government."⁶ The public has a significant interest in DHS asylum policy changes at the southern border, including the dangerous conditions asylum seekers face while waiting for their cases in Mexico⁷, and in

⁶ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁷ Hamed Aleaziz, *Trump Plans to Force Brazilian Asylum-Seekers to Wait in Mexico*, BUZZFEED NEWS, Jan. 22, 2020 (3:30 PM),

other newly proposed countries: Guatemala, Honduras, and El Salvador.⁸ Records with the potential to shed light on this matter would contribute significantly to public understanding of operations of the federal government, including how the agency plans to proceed with the policy that immigration advocates have called “a deadly game of musical chairs.” American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public’s understanding of the government’s activities would be enhanced through American Oversight’s analysis and publication of these records.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁹ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight’s financial interest. American Oversight’s mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.¹⁰

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through numerous substantive analyses posted to its website.¹¹ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department’s process for issuing such waivers;¹² posting records received as part of American Oversight’s “Audit the Wall”

<https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/hamedaleaziz/brazilian-asylum-seekers-wait-in-mexico>.

⁸ Hamed Aleaziz, *The ACLU and Others are Suing to Block the US from Sending Asylum-Seekers to Guatemala*, BUZZFEED NEWS, Jan. 22, 2020 (3:30 PM),

<https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/hamedaleaziz/safe-third-country-guatemala-lawsuit-challenge>.

⁹ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

¹⁰ American Oversight currently has approximately 15,395 page likes on Facebook and 101,100 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, FACEBOOK,

<https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Jan. 23, 2020); American Oversight (@weareoversight), TWITTER, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited Jan. 23, 2020).

¹¹ News, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

¹² *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco’s Recusal*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

project to gather and analyze information related to the administration's proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹³ posting records regarding potential self-dealing at the Department of Housing & Urban Development and related analysis;¹⁴ posting records and analysis relating to the federal government's efforts to sell nuclear technology to Saudi Arabia;¹⁵ and posting records and analysis regarding the Department of Justice's decision in response to demands from Congress to direct a U.S. Attorney to undertake a wide-ranging review and make recommendations regarding criminal investigations relating to the President's political opponents and allegations of misconduct by the Department of Justice itself and the Federal Bureau of Investigation.¹⁶

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Please search all locations and systems likely to have responsive records, regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics.
- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as

¹³ See generally *Audit the Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; see, e.g., *Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

¹⁴ *Documents Reveal Ben Carson Jr.'s Attempts to Use His Influence at HUD to Help His Business*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/documents-reveal-ben-carson-jr-s-attempts-to-use-his-influence-at-hud-to-help-his-business>.

¹⁵ *Investigating the Trump Administration's Efforts to Sell Nuclear Technology to Saudi Arabia*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigating-the-trump-administrations-efforts-to-sell-nuclear-technology-to-saudi-arabia>.

¹⁶ *Sessions' Letter Shows DOJ Acted on Trump's Authoritarian Demand to Investigate Clinton*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/sessions-letter>.

personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹⁷ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁸

- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁹ and many agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency’s archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.
- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

¹⁷ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹⁸ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

¹⁹ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Hart Wood at foia@americanoversight.org or (202) 873-1743. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Austin R. Evers". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal line extending to the left.

Austin R. Evers
Executive Director
American Oversight