



March 18, 2020

VIA EMAIL

Freedom of Information Officer
U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
1600 Clifton Road NE
Building 57, Room MS D-54
Atlanta, GA 30333
FOIARequests@cdc.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear FOIA Officer:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of your agency, 45 C.F.R. Part 5, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

The outbreak of the novel coronavirus, SARS-CoV-2, and the disease it causes, COVID-19, has been declared a public health emergency at both the national and international levels.¹ Since late 2019, the virus has spread to dozens of countries, sickened tens of thousands of people, and resulted in thousands of deaths.² The federal government's slow response to this crisis has brought renewed attention to the 2018 dissolution of the pandemic response team at the National Security Council,³ which, even at the time, drew concern about the administration's preparedness for an event like the coronavirus outbreak.⁴

¹ *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Situation Summary*, CENTERS FOR DISEASE CONTROL AND PREVENTION, <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/summary.html>.

² *Coronavirus Live Updates: W.H.O Says Covid-19 Has Higher Fatality Rate Than the Flu*, N.Y. TIMES, Mar. 4, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/04/world/coronavirus-news.html>.

³ Ken Dilanian et al., *Mismanagement, Missed Opportunities: How the White House Bungled the Coronavirus Response*, NBC NEWS (Mar. 14, 2020, 10:45 A.M.), <https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/white-house/mismanagement-missed-opportunities-how-white-house-bungled-coronavirus-response-n1158746>, Natasha Bertrand et al., *America's National Security Machine Stares Down a Viral Threat*, POLITICO (Mar. 12, 2020, 4:30 A.M.), <https://www.politico.com/news/2020/03/12/america-national-security-viral-threat-126574>

⁴ Lena H. Sun, *Top White House Officials in Charge of Pandemic Response Exits Abruptly*, WASH. POST, May 10, 2018, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/to-your-health/wp/2018/05/10/top-white-house-official-in-charge-of-pandemic-response-exits-abruptly/>.



American Oversight seeks records with the potential to shed light on this matter.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention the following records within twenty business days:

1. All email communications (including email messages, complete email chains, email attachments, calendar invitations) sent by any of the CDC officials specified in Column A, containing any of the key terms listed in Column B, in the chart below:

Column A: CDC Officials	Column B: Key Terms
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Anne Schuchat, Principal Deputy Director ii. Chesley Richards, Deputy Director for Public Health Science and Surveillance iii. Nancy Messonnier, Director for National Center for Immunization and Respiratory Diseases iv. Rima Khabbaz, Director of the National Center for Emerging and Zoonotic Infectious Diseases v. Martin Centron, Director, of the Division of Global Migration and Quarantine vi. Rebecca Martin, Director of the Center for Global Health vii. Michael F. Iademarco, former Acting CDC Deputy Director for Infectious Diseases viii. Stephen Redd, former Deputy Director for Public Health Service and Implementation Science 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Bossert ii. Ziemer iii. Borio iv. Luciana v. Bolton vi. Waddell vii. NSC viii. "National Security Council" ix. Pandemic x. "Global health" xi. "Health security" xii. "Bio defense" xiii. Biodefense xiv. "bio-defense" xv. Flu xvi. Influenza

American Oversight has limited its request to sent messages to reduce the volume of potentially responsive records. American Oversight still requests complete email chains. So, for example, if a government official sent a response to an incoming message containing one of the key terms above, the email chain containing the initially received message and the response is responsive to this request.

2. All email communications (including email messages, complete email chains, email attachments, calendar invitations) between (a) any of the CDC officials in Column A, and (b) any of the then-Executive Office of the President (EOP) officials listed in Column B.

Column A: CDC Officials	Column B: EOP officials
i. Anne Schuchat, Principal Deputy Director	i. John Bolton, former National Security Advisor
ii. Chesley Richards, Deputy Director for Public Health Science and Surveillance	ii. Ricky Waddell, former Deputy National Security Advisor
iii. Nancy Messonnier, Director for National Center for Immunization and Respiratory Diseases	iii. Tom Bossert, former Homeland Security Advisor
iv. Rima Khabbaz, Director of the National Center for Emerging and Zoonotic Infectious Diseases	iv. Rear Adm. Timothy Ziemer, former Senior Director for Global Health Security and Biodefense
v. Martin Centron, Director, of the Division of Global Migration and Quarantine	v. Luciana Borio, former National Security Council Director for Medical and Biodefense Preparedness
vi. Rebecca Martin, Director of the Center for Global Health	vi. Any other officials communicating with an email address ending in @nsc.eop.gov
vii. Michael F. Iademarco, former Acting CDC Deputy Director for Infectious Diseases	
viii. Stephen Redd, former Deputy Director for Public Health Service and Implementation Science	

For items 1 and 2, please provide all responsive records from April 9, 2018, through May 17, 2018.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency’s regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is “in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government.”⁵ The public has a significant interest in the administration’s response to the coronavirus outbreak. Records with the potential to shed light on this matter would contribute significantly to public understanding of operations of the federal government, including whether and to what extent previous actions by the Trump administration undermined the federal government’s ability to effectively respond to pandemics. American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public’s understanding of the government’s activities would be enhanced through American Oversight’s analysis and publication of these records.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁶ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight’s financial interest. American Oversight’s mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.⁷

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through numerous substantive analyses posted to its website.⁸ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department’s process for issuing such waivers;⁹ posting records received as part of American Oversight’s “Audit the Wall” project to gather and analyze information related to the administration’s proposed construction of

⁵ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁶ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁷ American Oversight currently has approximately 15,500 page likes on Facebook and 102,400 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, FACEBOOK, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Mar. 17, 2020); American Oversight (@weareoversight), TWITTER, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited Mar. 17, 2020).

⁸ News, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

⁹ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco’s Recusal*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹⁰ posting records regarding potential self-dealing at the Department of Housing & Urban Development and related analysis;¹¹ posting records and analysis relating to the federal government's efforts to sell nuclear technology to Saudi Arabia;¹² and posting records and analysis regarding the Department of Justice's decision in response to demands from Congress to direct a U.S. Attorney to undertake a wide-ranging review and make recommendations regarding criminal investigations relating to the President's political opponents and allegations of misconduct by the Department of Justice itself and the Federal Bureau of Investigation.¹³

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal

¹⁰ See generally *Audit the Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; see, e.g., *Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

¹¹ *Documents Reveal Ben Carson Jr.'s Attempts to Use His Influence at HUD to Help His Business*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/documents-reveal-ben-carson-jr-s-attempts-to-use-his-influence-at-hud-to-help-his-business>.

¹² *Investigating the Trump Administration's Efforts to Sell Nuclear Technology to Saudi Arabia*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigating-the-trump-administrations-efforts-to-sell-nuclear-technology-to-saudi-arabia>.

¹³ *Sessions' Letter Shows DOJ Acted on Trump's Authoritarian Demand to Investigate Clinton*, AMERICAN OVERSIGHT, <https://www.americanoversight.org/sessions-letter>.

Records Act and FOIA.¹⁴ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁵

- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁶ and many agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency’s archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.
- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

¹⁴ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹⁵ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

¹⁶ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records Directive,” M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Christine H. Monahan at foia@americanoversight.org or 202.869.5244. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Austin R. Evers". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal line extending to the left.

Austin R. Evers
Executive Director
American Oversight