



September 21, 2020

VIA EMAIL

Brandon Gaylor
Freedom of Information Officer
Department of Health and Human
Services
Hubert H. Humphrey Building, Room
729H
200 Independence Avenue SW
Washington, DC 20201
FOIARequest@hhs.gov

Freedom of Information Officer
U.S. Centers for Disease Control and
Prevention
1600 Clifton Road NE
Building 57, Room MS D-54
Atlanta, GA 30333
FOIARequests@cdc.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear FOIA Officers:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of your agencies, 45 C.F.R. Part 5, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

On Friday, September 18, 2020, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (“CDC”) posted revised guidelines regarding the transmission of the coronavirus SARS-CoV-2. The updated guidance stated that the virus can be spread “through respiratory droplets or small particles, such as those in aerosols, produced when an infected person coughs, sneezes, sings, talks or breathes,” and, indeed, that “[t]his is thought to be the main way the virus spreads.”¹ The guidance further advised that “[t]here is growing evidence that droplets and airborne particles can remain suspended in the air and be breathed in by others, and travel distances beyond 6 feet (for example, during choir practice, in restaurants, or in fitness classes).” On Monday, September 21, 2020, the CDC had removed the updated language and posted a notice that: “A draft version of proposed changes to these recommendations was posted in error to the agency’s official website. CDC is currently updating its recommendations regarding airborne transmission of SARS-CoV-2 (the virus that causes COVID-19). Once this process has been completed, the update [sic] language will be posted.”²

¹ Naomi Thomas, *Updated CDC Guidance Acknowledges Coronavirus Can Spread Through the Air*, CNN (Sept. 20, 2020, 10:15 PM), <https://www.cnn.com/2020/09/20/health/cdc-coronavirus-airborne-transmission/index.html?source=email>; see also Brianna Ehley, *CDC Says Coronavirus Is Airborne and Can Spread Farther than 6 Feet*, Politico (Sept. 21, 2020, 10:50 AM), <https://www.politico.com/news/2020/09/21/cdc-coronavirus-spread-airborne-419363>.

² *How Covid-19 Spreads*, CDC, <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/how-covid-spreads.html> (last updated Sept. 21, 2020); see also Tim Elfrink



This change notably follows a series of news reports indicating political interference with CDC guidelines and other publications.³ American Oversight seeks records with the potential to shed light on the removal of the updated transmission language from the CDC website.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that your agency produce the following records within twenty business days:

All electronic communications (including email messages, complete email chains, calendar invitations, Jabber instant messages, text messages and messages on similar electronic messaging applications (such as Signal, WhatsApp, Twitter DMs, etc.)) regarding the September 18, 2020 posting and September 21, 2020 removal of changes to the CDC's webpage "How Covid Spreads."⁴

American Oversight limits its request to those electronic communications sent or received by the individuals involved in the process of revising, clearing, and releasing language regarding the transmission of coronavirus for release on the CDC website. American Oversight believes that, at a minimum, a reasonable search would include but not be limited to the following officials and their immediate staff:

et al., *CDC Reverses Itself and Says Guidelines It Posted on Coronavirus Airborne Transmission Were Wrong*, Wash. Post (Sept. 21, 2020, 12:32 PM), <https://www.washingtonpost.com/nation/2020/09/21/cdc-covid-aerosols-airborne-guidelines/>.

³ See, e.g., Apoorva Mandavilli, *C.D.C. Testing Guidance Was Published Against Scientists' Objections*, N.Y. Times (Sept. 17, 2020), <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/09/17/health/coronavirus-testing-cdc.html>; Dan Diamond, *Trump Officials Interfered with CDC Reports on Covid-19*, Politico (Sept. 12, 2020, 11:11 AM), <https://www.politico.com/news/2020/09/11/exclusive-trump-officials-interfered-with-cdc-reports-on-covid-19-412809>; Nick Valencia et al., *CDC Was Pressured 'From the Top Down' to Change Coronavirus Testing Guidance*, Official Says, CNN (Aug. 27, 2020, 12:30 AM), <https://www.cnn.com/2020/08/26/politics/cdc-coronavirus-testing-guidance/index.html>; Helen Branswell & Kate Sheridan, *New Covid-19 Testing Guidelines, Crafted at the White House, Alarm Public Health Experts*, STAT, Aug. 26, 2020, <https://www.statnews.com/2020/08/26/new-covid19-testing-guidelines-crafted-at-white-house-alarm-public-health-experts/>; David Lim & Adam Cancryn, *Trump Officials Pressured CDC to Change Virus Testing Guidelines*, Politico (Aug. 26, 2020, 6:39 PM), <https://www.politico.com/news/2020/08/26/brett-giroir-coronavirus-testing-cdc-402524>.

⁴ *How Covid-19 Spreads*, CDC, <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/how-covid-spreads.html>. See Elfrink, *supra* note 2.

HHS

- i. Assistant Secretary Brett Giroir
- ii. Acting Assistant Secretary for Public Affairs Ryan Murphy
- iii. Senior Advisor Brad Traverse
- iv. Senior Advisor Gordon Hensley

CDC

- i. Director Robert Redfield
- ii. Principal Deputy Director Anne Schuchat
- iii. Acting Chief of Staff Witkofsky
- iv. Acting Associate Director for Communication Kate Galatas
- v. National Center for Immunization and Respiratory Diseases Nancy Messonnier

Please provide all responsive records from September 18, 2020, through September 21, 2020.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency's regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is "in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government."⁵ The public has a significant interest in the federal government's response to the coronavirus. Records with the potential to shed light on this matter would contribute significantly to public understanding of operations of the federal government, including whether and to what extent there is political interference with CDC's guidance to the public regarding the coronavirus.⁶ American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public's understanding of the government's activities would be enhanced through American Oversight's analysis and publication of these records.

This request is primarily and fundamentally for non-commercial purposes.⁷ As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight's financial interest. American Oversight's mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to

⁵ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁶ See *supra* notes 2–3.

⁷ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and Twitter.⁸

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through regular substantive analyses posted to its website.⁹ Examples reflecting this commitment to the public disclosure of documents and the creation of editorial content include the posting of records related to the Trump Administration's contacts with Ukraine and analyses of those contacts;¹⁰ posting records and editorial content about the federal government's response to the Coronavirus pandemic;¹¹ posting records received as part of American Oversight's "Audit the Wall" project to gather and analyze information related to the administration's proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹² the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department's process for issuing such waivers;¹³ and posting records and analysis of federal officials' use of taxpayer dollars to charter private aircraft or use government planes for unofficial business.¹⁴

⁸ American Oversight currently has approximately 15,600 page likes on Facebook and 105,300 followers on Twitter. American Oversight, Facebook, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Sept. 18, 2020); American Oversight (@weareoversight), Twitter, <https://twitter.com/weareoversight> (last visited Sept. 18, 2020).

⁹ See generally *News*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

¹⁰ *Trump Administration's Contacts with Ukraine*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/the-trump-administrations-contacts-with-ukraine>.

¹¹ See generally *The Trump Administration's Response to Coronavirus*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/the-trump-administrations-response-to-coronavirus>; see, e.g., *CDC Calendars from 2018 and 2019: Pandemic-Related Briefings and Meetings*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/cdc-calendars-from-2018-and-2019-pandemic-related-briefings-and-meetings>.

¹² See generally *Audit the Wall*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; see, e.g., *Border Wall Investigation Report: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/border-wall-investigation-report-no-plans-no-funding-no-timeline-no-wall>.

¹³ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco's Recusal*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/document/doj-civil-division-response-noel-francisco-compliance>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

¹⁴ See generally *Swamp Airlines: Chartered Jets at Taxpayer Expense*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/swamp-airlines-private-jets-taxpayer-expense>; see, e.g., *New Information on Pompeo's 2017 Trips to His Home State*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/new-information-on-pompeos-2017-trips-to-his-home-state>.

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

- Please search all locations and systems likely to have responsive records, regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. For instance, because the request seeks “electronic communications,” please search all locations likely to contain communications, including appropriate locations on hard drives and shared drives, emails, text messages or other direct messaging systems (such as iMessage, WhatsApp, Signal, or Twitter direct messages), instant messaging systems such as Lync or ICQ, and shared messages systems such as Slack.
- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹⁵ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁶
- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁷ and many

¹⁵ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹⁶ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

¹⁷ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records

agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency's archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight to discuss this request. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

Directive," M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Christine H. Monahan at foia@americanoversight.org or (202) 869-5244. Also, if American Oversight's request for a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Austin R. Evers". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal flourish extending to the left.

Austin R. Evers
Executive Director
American Oversight